

#### Federation of European Accountants Fédération des Experts comptables Européens

### FEE Tax Day

## Simple, fair, coordinated – tax Utopia in the EU?

1 October 2009



# Influence of the ECJ on Indirect Tax Policy

Paul Farmer, Dorsey & Whitney, UK



## Purposive or Teleological Interpretation

- ➤ Broad scope
- > Proportional to price
- > Tax on turnover
- Independent EU law meanings to ensure uniform interpretation



#### **General Principles**

- Equal treatment/fiscal neutrality:
  - e.g. Rompelman, Marks & Spencer (62/00)
- Effectiveness, legitimate expectations, legal certainty:
  - e.g. Marks & Spencer (309/06), Teleos
- Proportionality: e.g. Ecotrade, Collée, Louloudakis



#### Possible negatives?

- ➤ ECJ better in applying general principles and concepts than dealing with detailed technical questions.
- Dislocation of national and ECJ proceedings.
- > Lack of commercial awareness?



#### Structural problems

- > Judicial harmonisation.
- Very heavy caseload
- Possible factors contributing to volume of litigation:
  - \$infinite number of referable points
  - \$overly complex system
  - revenue concerns lead to disproportionate compliance obligations and severe penalty systems.



#### Solutions

- Ongoing debate on streamlining Community court system
- But real solution has to come from legislator
- Report of High Level Group on burden reduction in VAT (May 2009) referred to undue complexity and costs associated with VAT.
- Commission encouraged to think outside the box and investigate ideas even if they require deep structural changes.



### Federation of European Accountants *Visit us @ www.fee.be*



- > 43 professional institutes of accountants
- > 32 European countries, including all 27 EU